



Minutes of the meeting of the Planning Advisory Committee

Note to readers: the present minutes are translated from the original set of minutes, recorded in French.

May 7, 2019:

Erik Marosi declared a conflict of interest and left the meeting.
Conrad Peart chaired the public presentation held on May 7, 2019 at 8:30 am, following the publication of a notice on April 16, 2019.

During this public portion of the PAC meeting, the applicant was represented by Catherine Desjardins, Project Manager for CSDM; Martin Troy from Marosi Troy architects; landscape architect Sophie Robitaille from Robitaille Curtis; and the transportation and traffic engineer Jean-François Rouillon from Stantec.

The presentation order to the public and PAC members was as follows:

- Mrs. Desjardins presented the administrative background of the expansion project.
- Mr. Troy presented the architectural argument behind his design and the elements that characterize it.
- Mrs. Robitaille presented the landscaping project and planting.

There was a question period for the members followed by a period of questions and comments for the public.

The audio recording of this meeting can be consulted [here](#).

The first analysis and deliberation of the Committee will be held at its meeting of June 4, 2019.

June 4, 2019:

E. Marosi declared a conflict of interest and left the meeting.
Reviewed and deferred pending a revised proposal. The PPCMOI's proposal was partially reviewed by the Committee and deferred pending a revised proposal.
Given that this analysis is a first overview of the project, which is expected to evolve, and deals mainly with volumetric elements, the Committee postpones the development of the PPCMOI evaluation grid.

Massing

Although the proposal has been subdivided to deconstruct its volume, the Committee is of the opinion that the main volume is too articulated and wishes to see a simplified form. It is of the opinion that the one-story vestibule in the schoolyard, at the junction of the existing, would benefit from integrating into the volume of the "junction" between the new and the existing, wall-clad curtain. This revision would also simplify the architectural treatment.

Although the use of glass in is not allowed for large surfaces in residential buildings, the committee considers that the glass mass of the library fits in an acceptable way considering the contemporary and institutional nature of the project.

It is noted that the reduction of the height of the glass mass at the rooftop level could considerably increase the surface area of this educational terrace.

Since the mechanical housing must not be visible from the public way, the south elevation (p.32 « Agrandissement École Saint-Léon de Westmount » 2019-05-07) attempts to illustrate this

principle. However, no dimension or context (street, sidewalk) is given to determine the point of reference for the viewpoint.

After reading the sun studies, the Committee considers that the proposed project has minimal shading impacts on neighbouring properties.

Lighting

In order to mitigate light pollution, the Committee asks that measures to mitigate the negative effects of light spillage be introduced. The light emitted by the glass mass of the library and any security lighting in the yard should be studied to that effect.

Traffic management and parking

The project could offer interesting traffic management opportunities on site, however the Committee considers that these opportunities have not been explored sufficiently. While 9 parking spaces are required by regulation, the new project offers 20 (or 21, a coordination is required on pages 22, 50, 61). A reduction in the number of parking spaces would make it possible to include a protected drop-off and loading area for school buses (or to improve the greening rates). This approach would minimize the increase in traffic on Kitchener and Clarke Avenue related to the school expansion. It is noted that the location of the school is well served by public transit (metro and buses).

Revision

The next iteration should include a table of content to facilitate the reading of the documents and should take into account the comments made. Concerning the 52% reduction of hard surfaces with high albedo: the method of calculation must be revised to establish a ratio calculated on the whole lot: 1) current situation, without the expansion (existing condition) and 2) after, for the proposed project.

September 4, 2019 :

Erik Marosi declared a possible conflict of interest and left the meeting.

Reviewed and deferred. The Committee notes that the applicant has replied, by adjustment or explanation, to all the points raised at the previous meeting.

The revision to the south facade on the courtyard is favourably received, offering a tightening in the distribution of materials and a greater sobriety in the animation of the facade. This same approach could even be deployed on the facade parallel to the existing building located in the narrow courtyard near the students' entrance.

The junction of the extension with the existing building is carried out in plan by a constriction and in facades by a change of materials. On the north side, the link between the existing masonry and that of the extension is strongly expressed by the language of curtain walls on all floors, marking a clear division and indicating the entrance. The committee believes that, on the south side, this link could be further strengthened. Thus, it is perceived that the vertical separation offered by the curtain wall on the upper floors weakens when it extends laterally to the ground floor, creating a less clear division. One option to explore would be to support the new volume of masonry on the ground. The committee is aware that this would move the exterior wall inward around the access ramp.

The committee wishes to receive a full set of all updated plans and elevations at the next submission for a comprehensive analysis of the revisions. Concerning the materials, the 3D rendering shows the silk-screened glass of the library bordered horizontally by spandrel panels; the details of these panels must be submitted.

A stamped letter from Martin Troy, received on August 28, 2019, entitled Response to comments submitted by TAC on the Westmount St-Leon School Expansion Project was

submitted, including a site plan from Marosi Troy Architects and a technical note dated August 23, 2019 from Stantec. This document is referred to the Transportation Advisory Committee for analysis and comments.

The PAC continues to question the possibility of installing the parents' drop-off on a recessed lane (and not a U-shaped drop-off), an option that was not addressed by the CSDM consultants.

October 1, 2019 :

Erik Marosi declared a possible conflict of interest and left the meeting.

Reviewed and deferred. The information provided on the library's screen-printed glazing answers the Committee's questions. Since traffic issues are not yet resolved, as they are under discussion with the Transportation Advisory Committee, the PAC provides comments that could improve these revisions:

1. An analysis of the modes of travel of school users, as requested during the public presentation, would make it possible to design more appropriate proposals for the location and design of access and landing areas (cars, buses, pedestrians and cyclists);
2. Traffic management solutions should be presented with an integrated strategy that would encourage active and public transport modes. In this regard, the Committee encourages the applicant to also assess possible opportunities for a drop-off on De Maisonneuve, although this requires a longer walking distance for students.
3. If the car park is maintained on Clarke, then the development of the pedestrian access between the southern lateral facade and the property limit will need to be improved to provide a user-friendly access to the schoolyard. The proposed expansion eliminates the possibility of access to the schoolyard on the north side, along the existing parking lot, while increasing the number of daily visits through the only access point to the south of the existing building. Given the large capacity of the school, it would be desirable to include a second access point on the Clarke side of the schoolyard for schoolchildren at the north end, at the junction of the existing building and the expansion.
4. Despite the explanations provided, the Committee still deplores the choice of the high number of parking spaces, which exceeds the minimum number required by 11. At a minimum, an effort should be made to introduce green areas and a permeable surface into this area. The evaluation grid for the proposed SCAOPI is attached to this report.

Referred to the Transportation Advisory Committee.

November 26, 2019 :

Mr. Marosi declared a possible conflict of interest and left the meeting.

The representative of the Transportation Advisory Committee (TAC), Jonathan Auger, joined the PAC to present an overview of the transportation component of the project and the recommendations of its Committee.

In connection with several topics highlighted by the PAC, several preparatory meetings were held prior to the TAC meeting of 19 November 2019. The following are the directions of the circulation plan endorsed by the TAC:

- The school bus drop-off area (4 buses) will be located on Kitchener.
- Drop-off areas for parents will be provided:
 - Express drop-off on Clarke (16 cars) near the schoolyard access south of the existing building

- Drop-off on Kitchener (4 cars) near the kindergarten entrance, north of the school buses.
- Drop-off on Kitchener (4 cars) south of the school bus drop-off
- The express drop-off area must be managed by school staff to maintain traffic flow and limit obstructions.
- An extension of the schoolyard fence with an access door must be installed in the front yard on Clarke to establish the school's supervised safety perimeter.
- The schoolchildren's drop-off on the east side of Clarke must be discouraged.
- A communication campaign must be put in place to encourage active transport and good behaviour in traffic.

Recommended favourably to the municipal council on the conditions that:

1. A revised traffic plan around the school that responds to the TAC comments of November 19, 2019 be submitted for review and approval by the Urban Planning department.
2. Appropriate and convenient access to the playground, visible from the street, is provided on the south side of the existing building, near Clarke. Playgrounds and access to the schoolyard must be illuminated to create a pleasant and safe environment.
3. A communication campaign should be implemented covering traffic policy, promotion of active transportation (trottibus), specific traffic instructions to parents (at the beginning of the school year, reminders if necessary) and the presence of staff to proactively maintain traffic flow during the morning rush hour. This policy must be the subject of an annual meeting, or as required, with the Westmount Public Safety Department to determine its relevance and to make necessary adjustments.

Revised documents must be submitted for approval by the Urban Planning Department.

**GRILLE D'ÉVALUATION DU COMITE CONSULTATIF D'URBANISME APPLICABLE POUR L'ÉTUDE D'UNE DEMANDE DE PPCMOI
EVALUATION TABLE FOR THE PLANNING ADVISORY COMMITTEE FOR REVIEW OF AN APPLICATION UNDER SCAOPI**

Adresse & numéro de dossier: 360 Clarke, 2019-00069

Date d'analyse: May 29, September 4, October 1 and November 26, 2019

	General assessment criteria (By-law 1489 – 3.2)	Achievement level in light of assessment criteria						Comments
		No	Low	Moderate	High	Fully	N/A	
1	The proposal considers the general volume, height, siting and density of the existing constructions on the land as well as their integration into the built environment;				X			
2	For a proposal to alter or transform a construction of heritage value, care and effort is demonstrated in the conservation and enhancement of the heritage character-defining elements;				X			The original 1906 building was demolished in 1965. The proposed intervention minimizes the impact on the existing 1966 building by limiting the width at the joint and being highly transparent to allow for continuity of reading of the existing building. The choice of materials is in line with the existing.
3	The redevelopment proposal includes the conservation of a building of heritage value;				X			Refer to criterion 2.
4	The proposal results in an enhancement of the immovable and the neighbouring sectors with a refined and adapted landscaping, while also providing a superior construction quality;				X			The renewal of outdoor facilities offers a variety of landscaping treatments: playgrounds, podiums, rain gardens, roof gardens, screens planted in the courtyard, and new features on Clarke. The extension is marked by an articulated massing, at human scale and inviting, where architecture expresses and promotes a new, flexible and diversified pedagogical vision.
5	The proposal considers the impact on the urban environment, namely in terms of sunlight, wind, noise, emanations, lighting, water run-off, the reduction of heat islands and traffic;				X			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A moderate impact on sunlight for neighbours to the north is limited to the winter morning solstice (page 73) • The expansion helps to frame the schoolyard and creates a screen for the residences to the north. In the same idea, the orientation of the rooftop terrace is towards the school property rather than towards the neighbours. • The choice of mechanical equipment in the residential context was validated by a projected sound study (page 68) • The yard layout includes impermeable surfaces that slope towards the rain gardens and act as accumulation basins.

**GRILLE D'ÉVALUATION DU COMITE CONSULTATIF D'URBANISME APPLICABLE POUR L'ÉTUDE D'UNE DEMANDE DE PPCMOI
EVALUATION TABLE FOR THE PLANNING ADVISORY COMMITTEE FOR REVIEW OF AN APPLICATION UNDER SCAOPI**

Adresse & numéro de dossier: 360 Clarke, 2019-00069

Date d'analyse: May 29, September 4, October 1 and November 26, 2019

									<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The choice of landscaping surfaces allows a reduction from 84% to 53% of asphalt surfaces with high albedo. • The number of parking spaces exceeds the minimum number required by 11. An effort has been made to introduce green areas and a permeable surface in this area. • The increase in customers will likely result in an increase in car and bus traffic. The transportation plan could be revised to include an active transportation strategy for the school. • The T.A.C.'s comments request: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Maintaining the school bus drop-off area on Kitchener ○ That solutions limit the impact on the public domain and use private property, encourage active transportation and improve pedestrian safety and comfort.
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

**GRILLE D'ÉVALUATION DU COMITE CONSULTATIF D'URBANISME APPLICABLE POUR L'ÉTUDE D'UNE DEMANDE DE PPCMOI
EVALUATION TABLE FOR THE PLANNING ADVISORY COMMITTEE FOR REVIEW OF AN APPLICATION UNDER SCAOPI**

Adresse & numéro de dossier: 360 Clarke, 2019-00069

Date d'analyse: May 29, September 4, October 1 and November 26, 2019

	General assessment criteria (By-law 1489 – 3.2)	Achievement level in light of assessment criteria						Comments
		No	Low	Moderate	High	Fully	N/A	
6	The criteria of ecological design and the integration of sustainable, environmental features are integrated in the design process in accordance with LEED principles;				X			<p>The project has the following characteristics in terms of sustainable practices:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Natural ventilation ○ Control of thermal gains (summer) by green roof ○ Screen printing for solar control on library windows (page 42) ○ Vertical sunshades / sunshades made of frosted glass on the southwest facing facade (page 35) ○ Use of permeable materials on a large proportion of the playground ○ The choice of materials (red brick, zinc, limestone) is as much as possible in line with the logic of short circuits (proximity to raw resources and the place of manufacture / encouragement of the local economy / reduction of GHGs linked to transport). ○ The roofs of the proposed expansion are composed of white membranes and a green roof. ○ The design of integrated furniture and the choice of interior finishing materials will be based on sustainable products (within the limits of CSDM standards). See pages 34 to 36 for sustainable development strategies. ○ The layout of the courtyard includes impermeable areas inclined towards the rain gardens, acting as accumulation basins.
7	The proposal's functional organisation (access, security, automobile traffic, accessory buildings, parking) is of quality;				X			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Pedestrian access to the school is structured according to the clientele (daycare, buses, pedestrians, cars) and the time of day. ● For vehicular access, the traffic study provided (pages 64 to 67, + Appendix P) illustrates traffic by street, direction and time of day. The T.A.C. supports the maintenance of the

**GRILLE D'ÉVALUATION DU COMITE CONSULTATIF D'URBANISME APPLICABLE POUR L'ÉTUDE D'UNE DEMANDE DE PPCMOI
EVALUATION TABLE FOR THE PLANNING ADVISORY COMMITTEE FOR REVIEW OF AN APPLICATION UNDER SCAOPI**

Adresse & numéro de dossier: 360 Clarke, 2019-00069

Date d'analyse: May 29, September 4, October 1 and November 26, 2019

								school bus landing on Kitchener (scenario 2). See also notes to item 5.
8	The proposal seeks a balance between individual and collective interests in such a manner so as to avoid one being advanced to the disadvantage of the other;					X		Since the applicant is a public educational institution, the implementation of the expansion will provide better educational spaces for the Montreal society and the Westmount community.
9	The cultural and social components offer advantages to the community;					X		The building has been designed to ensure that some areas are open to the public after school hours: the outdoor areas at all times, and the agora, multifunctional room, and related services will be the subject of a possible agreement with the City.

*Applicable to all above criteria: All concerned parties (owners, neighbour, City) are able to benefit from an improvement upon the current situation or at the very least not experience any additional inconvenience.